## The Effect of Workplace Exposure on Professional Commitment: A Longitudinal Study of Nursing Professionals.

Submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**Julianne Parry** 

November 2006

**Central Queensland University** 

## **Abstract**

The behaviour of employees is increasingly being recognised as the critical factor in achievement of organisational effectiveness. Therefore, the need to address inefficiencies that are derived from the organisation-employee relationship is being recognised as important to organisational success. For many years the concept of organisational commitment provided the means to develop theory in relation to organisation-employee relationships. More recently, however, other types of work-related commitments have been identified as having importance to the organisation-employee relationship.

In the contemporary political-economic context, professionals are increasingly becoming employees of organisations which operate according to market or quasi-market principles. There are some fundamental differences between professional occupations and non-professional occupations. These differences may have consequences for the relationship between professional employees and their employing organisation. The differences may also have consequences for other workrelated outcomes for professional employees in ways that are different from the work-related outcomes of non-professional employees. Importantly, for professional employees commitment to the profession is developed during the pre-workplace entry educational experiences and may have consequences for the retention of professional employees within organisations, as well as retention within the profession. Therefore, the commitment of professional employees to their occupation may be both an antecedent to and a consequence of other work-related outcomes. However, to date, professional commitment has not been studied from a developmental perspective and the effect of workplace exposure on professional commitment is not understood.

This thesis reports the findings of a study in which a theoretical model of the relationship between professional commitment prior to workplace entry and professional turnover intention was evaluated using path analysis. The relationships included in the model were between commitment to the profession as both an antecedent to, and a consequence of organisational-professional conflict, job satisfaction and organisational commitment, as well as the relationship that each of

these variables may have to organisational turnover intention and professional turnover intention. A repeated measures design was used with a sample of nursing professionals. Professional commitment before entry to the workplace was measured, and after a period of workplace exposure, professional commitment was again measured, as well as the other work-related outcomes identified in the model. The Blau (2003) occupational commitment measure was used to measure the pre-and-post workplace entry levels of professional commitment. The thesis also examined the factor structure of the Blau (2003) occupational commitment measure.

The results of the model evaluation indicated that it is a plausible model of the identified relationships. Examination of the factor structure of the Blau (2003) occupational commitment measure indicated that it is best represented by five rather than four components. This research found that professional commitment was quite stable in the initial period of workplace exposure. The research findings also indicated that the relationship between professional commitment and organisational commitment was mediated by job satisfaction and that organisational-professional conflict and job satisfaction were directly related to organisational commitment. The research found that job satisfaction and professional commitment after a period of workplace exposure were related to organisational turnover intention, but that organisational commitment was not. The final major research finding was that organisational turnover intention was the only workplace variable in the model that was directly related to professional turnover intention.

This research has contributed to the organisational behaviour literature through the development and initial evaluation of a model of the relationship between professional commitment prior to workplace entry and professional turnover intention. The results of the model suggested that when organisations provide professional employees with workplace experiences that are professionally, as well as personally satisfying, they promote retention of professional employees with their own organisation, as well as retention of professionals within the profession.

This research recommends that for organisations that employ professionals, the model of the organisation-professional employee relationship that is likely to promote the retention of professional employees both within the organisation and within the profession, is a partnership model. Conflict resolution principles are recommended to inform the partnership model of the organisation-professional employee relationship. In addition, the empowering leadership style is recommended

for organisations that employ professionals, because it is better matched to the employment mode and characteristics of professional employees.

## Acknowledgements

Completion of a PhD thesis is never accomplished through the individual efforts of one person. There are many people, without whose involvement in the process, completion would not have been possible. The research would not have been able to be conducted without the involvement of the respondents to the study. I would like to thank them for their willingness to contribute a little of their time to participate in the study.

Many other people have helped to make completion of this PhD thesis possible. Some by sharing their academic wisdom, providing guidance and rigorous critique, others by helping me to maintain my belief in myself and my sense of humour in the face of the academic and personal difficulties that I have had to face over the years of the journey. Others have contributed by demonstrating great patience and forbearance as the journey has progressed.

Dr. Christine Murphy stands out as having helped in all of these ways. After a faltering start to the project, the support that Christine provided to me when she joined 'my team' in mid 2004 meant that I was able to forge ahead with the research in a way that had not previously been possible. With the added and similar support from Prof. Peter Smith, who joined the team in early 2005, the project has been able to progress to completion. I would also like to thank Assoc Prof. Robert Ho for providing academic wisdom, guidance and critique in relation to the statistical methods used in the research. Thanks also to Dr. Susan Yates, who has been enormously helpful, as well as patient, while we have worked through the process of the final editing of the thesis.

Pam Savage, Maude Chapman, Vivian Clift and Robyn Husband have been of great assistance to me over the course of the journey, by helping me to maintain my sense of humour and my belief in myself, in the face of the academic and personal difficulties that have been part of this journey. Their friendship and support has made a memorable contribution to the journey.

Finally and most importantly, the patience and forbearance that my children, Matthew and Meghan have shown me during this time has been outstanding. The teenage years present their own challenges, but to have the added challenge of a mother completing a PhD is one that Matt and Meg have managed well, along with

the usual challenges of their age. Their love and support have made a cherished contribution to this journey.

## **Table of Contents**

1	ne Ej	fect of Workplace Exposure on Professional Commitment	: A
Longitud	dinal .	Study of Nursing Professionals	_ 1
	Abst	ract	2
	Ackr	nowledgements	5
7	able o	of Contents	7
1	Int	roduction	_ 11
	1.1	Background to the Research	
	1.2	The Research Problem, and Research Questions	_ 13
	1.3	Justification for the Research	_ 17
	1.4	Methodology and Methods	_ 20
	1.5	Outline of the Thesis	_ 21
	1.6	Definitions used in the Research	_ 25
	1.7	Conclusion	_ 29
2	Re	search Issues – Work-Related Commitment, Professionalis	m,
Profession	onal C	Commitment and Workplace Exposure	_ 30
	2.1	Introduction	_ 30
	2.2	Overview of the Theoretical and Research Literature in	
Relation	on to V	Work-Related Commitment.	_ 34
	2.3	Professional, Professionalism and Professionalisation	_ 47
	2.4	Professional Commitment and Exposure to the Workplace_	_ 58
	2.5	The Research in Relation to Professional Commitment,	
Organ	isatio	nal Commitment, Organisational Turnover Intention and	
Profes	sional	Turnover Intention	_ 63
	2.6	Conclusion	70

<i>3</i> .	T	he Research Sample and Sample-related Issues	73
<b>•</b>	3.1	Introduction	73
<u> </u>	3.2	The Nursing Shortage	76
<b>3</b>	3.3	Reasons for the Workforce Shortage	80
<b>3</b>	3.4	Conclusion	86
4	Meti	hodology, Methods and the Theoretical Model	87
4	4.1	Introduction	87
4	4.2	Justification for the Paradigm and Methodology	89
	4.2.2	2 Limitations of the Methodology – Threats to validity	91
	4.2.3	3 Justification for the Methods	96
	4.2.4	Limitations of the Methods	97
4	4.4	The Theoretical Model	100
4	4.5	Measures	107
4	4.6	Data Collection Procedures	110
4	4.7	Conclusion	113
5.	$A_{l}$	nalysis of the Data – The Components of the Blau (2	003)
cupatio	onal C	Commitment Measure	115
4	5.1	Introduction	115
4	5.2	The Measurement of Occupational Commitment	117
	5.3	Method	121
	5.3.1		
	5.3.2	2 The Measure of Professional Commitment	131
	5.3.3	Preparation of the Data for Analysis	132
4	5.4	Results	134
	5.4.1	Results of the Time One Data Collection	134
	5.4.2	Results of the Time Two Data Collection	145
	5.4.3	Repeated Measures Comparisons	154
4	5.5	Discussion	158

5.5	.1 The Factor Structure of the Blau (2003) Occupational Comm	itment
Measure	161	
5.5	.2 The Effect of Exposure to the Workplace on Professional Co	mmitment
	163	
5.6	Conclusion	168
<b>6.</b> A	nalysis of the Data – Evaluation of the Theoretical M	odel
using Path An	alysis	171
6.1	Introduction	171
6.2	Method	175
6.2	.1 Measures	175
6.2	.2 Preparation of the Data for Analysis	176
6.3	Results	179
6.3	.1 Overall Results of the Models	186
6.3	.2 The Results in Terms of the Research Questions	203
6.4	Discussion	231
6.5	Conclusion	246
7 Dis	cussion, Implications and Conclusions	250
7.1	Introduction	250
7.2	The Key Results and Conclusions of the Research	255
7.3	Implications for Theory	261
7.4	Implications for Policy and Practice	272
7.5	Limitations	277
7.6	Further Research	280
7.7	Conclusion	292
Refer	rences	295

Appendices	310
Appendix 1: The Costs Associated with a Non-partnership Model	of
the Organisation - Professional Employee Relationship	_ 311
The Costs Associated with a Non-partnership Model of the Organisation -	
Professional Employee Relationship: An Example from the Profession of Nursing	_ 312
Appendix 2: Central Queensland University Human Ethics Resear	rch
Committee - Initial Letter of Approval of Project	_ 316
Appendix 3: The Time Two Copy of the Survey Questionnaire	_ 319
Appendix 4: Initial Letter of Invitation to Participate in Research	and
Consent Form	_ 330
Appendix 5: Samples of Results Output	_ 334
Full Model Output	_ 335
Affective Professional Commitment Component Model Output	_ 337
Appendix 6: Model of the Relationship between Professional	
Commitment and Organisational Turnover Intention	_ 339